

**Meeting of the Independent Police Complaints Council (IPCC)
with the Complaints & Internal Investigations Branch (C&IIB) (Open Part)
held at the IPCC Secretariat Office at 1515 hours on Tuesday, 17 December 2024**

Present:

IPCC

Ms Priscilla WONG Pui-sze, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, GBS, JP (Vice-chairman)
Hon Ronick CHAN Chun-ying, BBS, JP (Vice-chairman)
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, BBS, JP (Vice-chairman)
Dr Daniel CHAN Ching-yan, BBS, MH
Ms Mabel CHAN Mei-bo, JP
Prof LIN Feng
Mr Randy YU Hon-kwan, MH, JP
Dr Desmond NGUYEN Gia-hung
Mr Ivan SZE Wing-hang, BBS, JP
Mr Kevin CHAN Wing-tak
Mr Matthew LAM Kin-hong, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Jimmy WONG Chi-ho, SBS, BBS, JP

Police

Mr Derek LUI Kam-ho, DMS
Ms Sally TSUI Sheung-yea, ACP SQ
Ms Karen TSANG Shuk-yin, CSP C&IIB
Mr Stephen YU Wai-kit, SSP CAPO
Mr LEUNG Ming-leung, SSP OPS PHQ
Mr Rick CHAN Wai-kei, SP HQ CAPO (Joint Secretary)
Mr Lawrence CHAN Yin-mat, SP CAPO HKI
Ms NIEH Dorothy, SP CAPO K
Mr Christie LAM Yiu, SP CAPO NT
Mr Ron YUNG Kin-sik, CIP OPS 2A PHQ OPS
Mr Anson LAM Ho-wa, SIP OPS 2B PHQ OPS

Secretariat

Mr Daniel MUI Tat-ming, SG
Ms Regina LAU Ngai-kit, DSG (OPS)
Mr Steve SIN Ving-chung, DSG (MGT) (Atg) (Joint Secretary)
Ms Vivian HO Wei-wun, LA

Absent with apologies:

IPCC

Mr CHAN Chak-ming
Mr LEE Man-bun, MH, JP
Ms Jane Curzon LO, BBS, JP
Ms Cindi HUI Ming-ming
Dr Stanley YIM Yuk-lun, SBS, BBS, JP

Opening Address

The Chairman welcomed all to the meeting.

I. Confirmation of Minutes of the Meeting held on 17 September 2024 (Open Part)

2. The minutes of the last meeting were confirmed without amendment.

II. Presentation on ‘Territory-wide CCTV Installation Scheme’

3. SSP OPS PHQ introduced to the meeting the ‘Territory-wide CCTV Installation Scheme’, which was a government-led initiative implemented by the Police in collaboration with various government bureaux and departments, under the auspices of the Task Force on District Governance chaired by the Deputy Chief Secretary for Administration. The purposes of the installation were for crime prevention, crime detection and preservation of public order and public safety.

4. SSP OPS PHQ then laid out the installation plan that the Police were in the process of installing 2,000 sets of CCTVs to be completed by the end of 2025 under the scheme’s ongoing first phase, and then would install up to 2,000 to 2,500 sets annually, ultimately reaching about 6,000 to 7,000 sets in 2027. In relation to the installation locations, the first phase of the scheme primarily focused on installing CCTVs at government premises, transport hubs and ordinary / smart lampposts, taking into consideration the crime rates and related data across various districts, as well as the characteristics, pedestrian flow, risks and public order situation of the respective districts. The installation locations would extend to other platforms including the gantries, traffic lights, Belisha beacons, red light cameras, solar-powered cameras, etc. to optimise the use of government resources.

5. SSP OPS PHQ also shared with the meeting the effectiveness of the scheme in enhancing the local security level. Totally, there were 97 crime cases detected (as of 17 December 2024) with the use of the CCTV footage captured under the scheme. Other than that, the Police also made use of the CCTVs to estimate crowd size in Lan Kwai Fong during the Halloween crowd management operation in October 2024. He also quoted the experience of other countries or regions in detecting crimes using CCTVs for the meeting’s reference.

6. With regard to privacy protection, SSP OPS PHQ highlighted that the CCTVs under the scheme would only capture public places. The Police had consulted the Department of Justice (DoJ) and commissioned an independent consultancy to conduct the Privacy Impact Assessment for installing CCTVs in public areas. SSP OPS PHQ also reaffirmed that the Police would ensure the implementation of the scheme to be in strict compliance with the relevant laws of Hong Kong, whilst maintaining close liaison with the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data (PCPD) to ensure the public's right to privacy would be upheld. The Police would display a conspicuous notice in close proximity to the CCTVs, explicitly informing the public that the CCTVs were in operation. If private places were captured on CCTVs, the Police would mask them using digital masking technology. The CCTV footage would be automatically erased after the lapse of 31 days unless the same were found having evidential value.

7. Concerning information security, SSP OPS PHQ reassured that the Police had taken reference to the guidelines from the Digital Policy Office and engaged an independent consultancy to conduct safety risk assessment and audit for the system, with a view to ensuring the security of the infrastructure, hardware and software components and data transmission solutions supporting the system. The CCTV system was operated by the Police with comprehensive and strict internal guidelines and supervision.

8. SSP OPS PHQ concluded his presentation by appreciating the support and positive feedback from the public towards the scheme. The Police would continue its efforts to implement the scheme in collaboration with other government departments making reference to the successful experience from other countries and regions.

9. The Chairman thanked SSP OPS PHQ for his informative presentation and invited questions from Members.

10. Hon Jimmy NG enquired if the CCTVs had an audio recording function, which would assist in detecting crimes further. SSP OPS PHQ replied that the CCTVs under the scheme had no audio recording function at present, but the Police would review such an operational need at a later stage, with due consideration of the mechanism of similar CCTV systems in other countries or regions.

11. Hon Ronick CHAN raised if there would be any difficulty in posting a notice of the scheme at gantries, and how the Police would handle the request for CCTV footage for cases not involving crime such as insurance claims. SSP OPS PHQ noted the challenge of posting the notice at different locations, which

would be further explored. Regarding the request for data, he explained that the public had the right to request access to personal data captured on the footage in accordance with the law. The request would, however, be denied if the case had entered the judicial process or the footage was linked to cases involving security concerns.

12. Dr Daniel CHAN, Chairman of the Publicity and Community Relations Committee, questioned if there was any plan to use CCTVs to enforce traffic regulations, such as ticketing vehicles or targeting jaywalking. Also, he raised whether there was any avenue for the public to make opposition to the installation locations. SSP OPS PHQ replied that the Police, at the current stage, had no plan to enforce traffic regulations with the use of CCTVs under the scheme. Having said that, the Police would continue to explore the use of CCTVs in different aspects of traffic enforcement. Regarding the installation locations, so far the feedback received from the public was positive. SSP OPS PHQ reiterated that the CCTVs would only cover public places. If private areas were covered, the Police would mask the areas using digital masking technology.

13. In response to Mr Kevin CHAN's suggestion of using drones to enhance the flexibility of application under the scheme, SSP OPS PHQ thanked him for the suggestion and supplemented that the current plan of the scheme was to extend the CCTV coverage in the territory. While the Police would continue to explore the use of drones, some legal and technical issues would need to be sorted out.

14. Ms Mabel CHAN, Chairman of the Management Committee, enquired about the next phase after installing 7,000 sets of CCTVs. She also raised concerns about the suitability and restrictions of installing solar-powered CCTVs. SSP OPS PHQ replied that the next phase of installation would depend on the technology development, and the Police would duly conduct a review on that. He supplemented that solar-powered cameras could be an alternative in rural area with unstable electricity supply.

15. Mr Matthew LAM raised concerns about the security of the footage collected and potential data breach during the 31-day storage period. He also invited the Police to take reference from Singapore, where facial recognition technology was adopted at the immigration control points at the airport. In response, SSP OPS PHQ stressed that an independent consultancy had conducted a safety risk assessment and audit for the system to ensure the information security. In the scenario of a hacker breach, the CCTV footage were encrypted, and the data would still be intact without the risk of leakage. About the application of facial recognition, SSP OPS PHQ replied that the

Police would continue to learn the successful stories from other countries or regions and to apply relevant technologies in Hong Kong as appropriate.

16. DMS supplemented that while the whole government including the Police had put a lot of emphasis and efforts on information security, the previous hacker breach incidents at the other government departments were mainly attributed to the fault of using private clouds to store data. For the Police, the design of the data storage had been carefully assessed by an independent consultancy to ensure the security without using any private clouds. As regards the installation of CCTVs at solar panels, DMS explained that some topical crimes, such as smuggling activities, were rampant in rural areas, where the electricity supply was unstable. The use of solar-powered cameras, from the operational perspective, would assist the Police in tackling such crimes.

17. SG enquired about how the frontline police officers could timely view the CCTV footage for investigation, as well as the rationale of setting the cap of the footage storage period at 31 days. SSP OPS PHQ explained that there were officers at command and control centres who could view the footage immediately, and frontline officers could also view the footage in real time at police stations. The period of 31-day storage was determined based on a wide range of factors, namely the experience of other countries or regions, the Police's experience of investigation, cost effectiveness and the advice from the DoJ and PCPD.

18. Hon Frankie YICK, Chairman of the Serious Complaints Committee, raised questions and comments on four aspects. First of all, the Police should share data under the scheme with other government departments. Second, the Police should consider equipping the audio recording function in the CCTV system. Third, the CCTV footage should be used in enforcing traffic regulations, especially at the yellow box junction, where road users often ignored them. Fourth, the Police should increase the number of CCTV installation for road safety bearing in mind that the driving etiquette and traffic flow in Mainland China had significantly improved as a result of the use of CCTVs.

19. Regarding the suggestion of data sharing among the government departments, SSP OPS PHQ replied that while the DoJ's initial comment had supported such, there were still some hardware and software issues to be sorted out before its implementation. In terms of audio recording function and traffic enforcement with the use of CCTVs, the Police would continue to review those aspects according to the operational need. About the number of CCTV installation, the Police would timely review the number of CCTVs installed at different phases with due consideration of technology development.

20. DMS supplemented that the Police had worked in collaboration over data sharing with other government departments for the purpose of crime prevention. With regard to the audio recording function, the effectiveness would depend on the distance between the incident location and the CCTV. About the traffic enforcement, the Police would continue to make use of the technology to enhance the effectiveness. Lastly, the actual number of CCTV to be installed under the scheme would also depend on the public resources, where the support from the Councillors was required.

21. Dr Daniel CHAN, Chairman of the Publicity and Community Relations Committee, believed that the majority of the public would support the scheme for crime prevention and detection. He opined that the Police should ensure sufficient communication with the public on the Police's use of CCTVs so that they would be aware of relevant laws and regulations.

22. DMS appreciated the comments and reaffirmed that the Police would continue to review the effectiveness of the scheme and provide sufficient explanations to the public on the use of the CCTVs as appropriate.

III. Matters for Information

(a) CAPO's Monthly Statistics

23. SSP CAPO reported that 1,660 Reportable Complaints (RCs) were received in the first eleven months of 2024, representing an increase of 61 complaints (+4%) when compared with 1,599 complaints in the same period of 2023. In terms of allegations, those of minor nature (e.g. Neglect of Duty, Misconduct / Impoliteness and Offensive Language) consistently accounted for nearly 95% out of all allegations over the past three years. Breakdown of the allegations was detailed in Annex-Table 1. SSP CAPO further reported that no serious allegation was classified as 'Substantiated / Not Fully Substantiated' between January and November 2024.

24. Hon Frankie YICK commented that while there was an increase in the number of complaints in 2024, he noticed that many of the complaints were in fact not pursuable, where the complainants did not provide assistance in complaint investigation after lodging the complaint to the Police, which undoubtedly wasted the public resources. The Chairman shared the same view and reminded again of the complainants' responsibility for lodging a complaint.

(b) **CAPO's Criminal and Disciplinary Checklist**

23. SSP CAPO reported that relevant information had been provided to Members for their reference prior to the meeting. No question was raised under this item.

IV. Any Other Business

24. There being no other business, the meeting concluded at 1630 hours.

(Rick CHAN)
Joint Secretary
Complaints and Internal
Investigations Branch

(Steve SIN)
Joint Secretary
Independent Police
Complaints Council

Table 1 - Detailed Breakdown of Allegations in Reportable Complaints

Year (January-November)		2024 (2024 vs 2023)	2023	2022
Minor	Neglect of Duty	1,140 (+5.4%)	1082	796
	Misconduct/Impoliteness	884 (-10.4%)	987	727
	Offensive Language	37 (-17.8%)	45	52
Sub-total		2,061 (-2.5%)	2,114	1,575
Serious	Assault	79	79	81
	Threat	6 (-45.5%)	11	3
	Unnecessary Use of Authority	22 (-18.5%)	27	23
	Fabrication of Evidence	3 (+50%)	2	3
Sub-total		110 (-7.6%)	119	110
Total (All Allegations)		2,171 (-2.8%)	2,233	1,685